

November 6, 2021

Hands Off Our Children

Dear Premier Ford,

Please accept our response to the October 26, 2021 Report of the Ontario COVID-19 Science Advisory Table (OST) concerning COVID-19 Injectable Biological Products (hereafter 'COVID products') for children and youth. We represent scientists, health and other professionals, and academics from various disciplines who have followed, evaluated, and reported on the handling of COVID-19 for over a year. In an earlier letter, we expressed our opposition to mandating COVID products for health workers, and our support for prevention and early treatment, for well-staffed health establishments, and for the best possible work conditions for health workers.¹ We are encouraged that our recommendations may have informed your decision to abandon the policy of COVID product mandates for these workers.

We are writing to you again to plead that you oppose authorizing COVID products for our children and youth. Such authorization is likely to result in a public health disaster, for years to come, and of a magnitude that is hard to anticipate.

Once again, our position departs radically from the position of the OST as presented in their recent report, "Behavioural Science-Informed Strategies for Increasing COVID-19 Vaccine Uptake in Children and Youth". ² The reference to 'science' in its title notwithstanding, the report offers no scientific evidence that COVID products are safe, effective, or necessary to protect the health of our children and youth. Instead, it *assumes* safety, effectiveness, and necessity and, based on these (false) assumptions, elaborates on what psychological strategies can be deployed by 'trusted sources' – health care professionals, educators, and other community leaders – to persuade young Ontarians and their adult caretakers to embrace these COVID products. The authors also seem to assume, again without evidence, that COVID products are like traditional vaccines delivered in Canada and elsewhere for years. That much can be gleaned from the claim that "in the last two decades, there

¹ Chaufin, C., MD PhD, Pelech, S., PhD, McLeod, D., HBSc, Rancourt, D., PhD, Francis, D., PhD, RN, Collins, O., BSc, Ponesse, J., PhD, Vrbik, J., PhD, Forte, M., PhD, de Ruiter, A., PhD, Graham, J., PhD, & Epstein-Gilboa, K., PhD. (2021, October 28). *Response: COVID-19 vaccine mandates for Ontario's hospital workers*. United Health Care Workers of Ontario. Retrieved November 16, 2021, from <u>https://uhcwo.com/response-sat</u>

² Shapiro, G. K., Presseau, J., Weerasinghe, A., Allen, U., Arnason, T., Bodmer, N. S., Born, K. B., Buchan, J. L., Burns, R., Corace, K. M., Dubey, V., Evans, G. A., Fabrigar, L. R., Grimshaw, J. M., Maguire, J. L., Manuel, D. G., Morris, S. K., Mosher, R., Orkin, J., . . . Desveaux, L. (2021). *Behavioural Science-Informed Strategies for Increasing COVID-19 Vaccine Uptake in Children and Youth.* Science Briefs. Published. https://doi.org/10.47326/ocsat.2021.02.50.1.0



has been an increase in the development of strategies aiming to promote vaccine uptake in children and youth." (p. 4).

But what if our children were better off without those COVID products, such that persuasion would be tantamount to false advertising? What if COVID products were nothing like traditional vaccines, such that it would be scientifically unfounded and even morally wrong to prey on the public's trust in vaccines to persuade it to accept a very different, potentially harmful, medical product?

To set the record straight, allow us to present an overview of the science underlying COVID products, especially as they concern young Ontarians:

1. Risk of death of COVID-19 for children is statistically zero

The major risk factor for serious COVID-19 is age. For ages 0 to 19, the death rate is statistically zero.³ COVID-19 is mostly mild in this age range and long-term sequelae are rare.⁴ In Sweden, with a population of 10 million, no children died of COVID-19 even though there were no lockdowns, no masks, and hardly any school closures.⁵ A recent, widely circulated New York Times article falsely claimed that over 900,000 children in the USA had been hospitalized due to COVID-19, overestimating the real number of 63,000 hospitalized children by a factor of 14.⁶ Even the lower number of 63,000 has been questioned, with some estimates of 39% to 48% of children originally admitted to hospital for unrelated illness but acquiring COVID-19 in the hospital.⁷ The roughly 300 deaths of children in the USA were among children *with multiple comorbidities who were not offered early*

³ Ledford, H. (2021). *Deaths from COVID 'incredibly rare' among children*. Nature, 595(7869), 639. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-021-01897-w</u>

⁴ Abi-Jaoude, E., & Doshi, P. (2021, July 13). *Covid-19 vaccines for children: hypothetical benefits to adults do not outweigh risks to children*. The BMJ. Retrieved November 24, 2021, from

https://blogs.bmj.com/bmj/2021/07/13/covid-19-vaccines-for-children-hypothetical-benefits-to-adults-do-not-outweigh-risks-to-children/

⁵ Ludvigsson, J. F., Engerström, L., Nordenhäll, C., & Larsson, E. (2021). *Open Schools, Covid-19, and Child and Teacher Morbidity in Sweden*. New England Journal of Medicine, 384(7), 669–671. <u>https://doi.org/10.1056/nejmc2026670</u>

⁶ The New York Times. (2021, October 8). *Corrections: Oct. 8, 2021*. Retrieved November 24, 2021, from <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2021/10/08/pageoneplus/corrections-oct-8-2021.html</u>

⁷ Digitale, E. (2021, May 19). *COVID-19 hospitalizations among children likely overcounted, researchers find*. Stanford Medicine. Retrieved November 24, 2021, from http://med.stanford.edu/news/2021/05/covid-19-hospitalizations-among-kids-likely-overcounted.html



treatment. However, by the time the paper retracted its error the false information had already impacted public opinion.

2. Children pose no risk to adults

A peer reviewed article in the prestigious journal *Pediatrics* found that most studies indicate that children are very unlikely to transmit the infection to adults in the household or at school, and when they develop COVID-19 it is generally a very mild form,⁸ one that elicits durable, comprehensive, and strong natural immunity.⁹ These data, combined with the Swedish data showing that leaving schools open did not lead to higher rates of COVID-19 among teachers, should reassure policymakers that children pose no risk to adults - grandparents, parents, or teachers. Moreover, it would be unprecedented in a democratic society like Canada if children were used as a means to an end - subjected to an experimental medical treatment, as these COVID products are, to shield adults or the elderly. As Dr. Peter Doshi, Associate Editor of the British Medical Journal, has pointed out, 'even if we were to assume [protection against COVID-19 with vaccines], *the number of children who would need to be vaccinated to protect just one adult from a bout of severe COVID-19 [...] would be extraordinarily high [and] would compare unfavorably to the number of children that would be harmed, including for rare serious events.⁴*

3. Children who develop COVID-19 can be treated with safe and effective drugs

There exist multiple safe, effective, and inexpensive, generic drugs to treat COVID-19 - for the rare cases when treatment is necessary, i.e., among children with multiple comorbidities - that have been used in all age groups, even young children.¹⁰ A systematic review of 15 clinical trials indicated that the Nobel Prize winning antiparasitic drug Ivermectin (IVM) can be successfully applied to the treatment of viral diseases, including

⁸ Lee, B., & Raszka, W. V. (2020). COVID-19 in Children: Looking Forward, Not Back. Pediatrics, 147(1), e2020029736. https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.2020-029736

⁹ Garrido, C., Hurst, J. H., Lorang, C. G., Aquino, J. N., Rodriguez, J., Pfeiffer, T. S., Singh, T., Semmes, E. C., Lugo, D. J., Rotta, A. T., Turner, N. A., Burke, T. W., McClain, M. T., Petzold, E. A., Permar, S. R., Moody, M. A., Woods, C. W., Kelly, M. S., & Fouda, G. G. (2021). *Asymptomatic or mild symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection elicits durable neutralizing antibody responses in children and adolescents.* JCI Insight, 6(17). https://doi.org/10.1172/jci.insight.150909

¹⁰ Procter, B. C., Ross, C., Pickard, V., Smith, E., Hanson, C., & McCullough, P. A. (2020). *Clinical outcomes after early ambulatory multidrug therapy for high-risk SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) infection*. Reviews in Cardiovascular Medicine, 21(4), 611. <u>https://doi.org/10.31083/j.rcm.2020.04.260</u>



COVID-19, and reduces infection by an average of 86%.¹¹ A more recent report of 64 clinical trials, 30 of them randomized and controlled, indicated 67% effectiveness in prophylaxis, 84% in early treatment, and 20% in late treatment using protocols that include IVM at different doses and for different periods of time.¹² Another meta-analysis of 18 Randomized Controlled Trials of IVM in COVID-19 found large, statistically and clinically significant, reductions in mortality, time to clinical recovery, and time to viral clearance.¹³ Finally, many examples of IVM distribution campaigns - in Mexico City, several states in India, and several Argentinian provinces leading to rapid population-wide decreases in morbidity and mortality among all age groups, indicate the safety and effectiveness of this oral medication in all phases of COVID-19.¹⁴ In light of the wealth of data supporting treatment modalities that can help to overcome the current public health, social, and economic crisis in Canada, the suppression and gross misrepresentation - by leading regulatory agencies and mainstream media¹⁵ – and the efforts of medical colleges to criminalize doctors who treat COVID-19 patients with IVM and other repurposed drugs,¹⁶ is unjustified and nothing short of scandalous. It is also unjustifiable to risk the health of young Ontarians by subjecting them to unnecessary medical experiments when safe and effective alternatives exist.

4. COVID-19 products are not like traditional vaccines

Traditional vaccines, involving inactivated or attenuated viral particles have decades of research supporting their safety and effectiveness, i.e., their ability to stop transmission in the real world and not only in randomized controlled trials, with no major adverse effects. Still, vaccination is not mandatory in Canada,¹⁷ so

¹¹ Bryant, A., Lawrie, T. A., Dowswell, T., Fordham, E. J., Mitchell, S., Hill, S. R., & Tham, T. C. (2021). Ivermectin for Prevention and Treatment of COVID-19 Infection. American Journal of Therapeutics, Publish Ahead of Print. https://doi.org/10.1097/mit.00000000001402

¹² CovidAnalysis. Ivermectin for COVID-19: real-time meta analysis of 64 studies. IVMMeta. Retrieved October 26, 2021, from https://ivmmeta.com/

¹³ Kory, P., Meduri, G. U., Varon, J., Iglesias, J., & Marik, P. E. (2021). Review of the Emerging Evidence Demonstrating the Efficacy of Ivermectin in the Prophylaxis and Treatment of COVID-19. American Journal of Therapeutics, 28(3), e299-e318. https://doi.org/10.1097/mit.00000000001377 ¹⁴ Chamie, J. (2021, August 1). Epidemiologic analyses on Ivermectin in COVID-19. FLCCC | Front Line COVID-19 Critical Care Alliance. Retrieved

November 24, 2021, from https://covid19criticalcare.com/ivermectin-in-covid-19/epidemiologic-analyses-on-covid19-and-ivermectin/

¹⁵ U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA). (2021, September 3). Why You Should Not Use Ivermectin to Treat or Prevent COVID-19. Retrieved November 17, 2021, from https://www.fda.gov/consumers/consumer-updates/why-vou-should-not-use-ivermectin-treat-or-prevent-covid-19

¹⁶ White, R. (2021, September 23). Alberta's colleges of physicians and pharmacists voice concerns over ivermectin prescriptions. CTV News. Retrieved November 24, 2021, from

https://calgary.ctvnews.ca/alberta-s-colleges-of-physicians-and-pharmacists-voice-concerns-over-ivermectin-prescriptions-1.5597861

¹⁷ Boucher, F., Dollin, J., Guilfoyle, J., Guthrie, C., Landry, M., Laycock, J., Palkonyay, L., Division of Immunization Steering Committee, Douville-Fradet, M., Law, B., Avard, D., Lundy, C., Millar, J., Palacios, C., Waters, J., Blinco, K., Daly, P., Horne, D., McDermott, C., . . . Sockett, P. (1997, May). Canadian National Report on Immunization, 1996 (No. 23S4). Health Canada.



mandating COVID products in schools - as they currently are in post-secondary educational establishments – would be unprecedented in Canadian history. Such mandates are also a major violation of the right to informed consent, which by definition must be free from coercion.¹⁸ In the case of the very young, it is also a major violation of the right to decide on the medical procedures performed on their children.

5. <u>COVID-19 vaccine products are not safe – for adults or children</u>

Several countries have stopped using COVID products in the young. Finland, Sweden and Denmark no longer use them in the population under 30 years of age due to concerns about myocarditis.¹⁹ A retrospective assessment of reports filed to the US Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System (VAERS) between January 1, 2021, and June 18, 2021, among healthy adolescents ages 12-17 who received COVID products, identified that this age group was up to six times more likely to be diagnosed with myocarditis than to be hospitalized for COVID-19.²⁰

In Canada, a recent SickKids report notes that heart disease among the young - myocarditis and pericarditis - have risen since the launch of the vaccination campaign, and instructs clinicians on treatment of adverse events post injection - abdominal pain, vomiting, encephalopathy, and in some severe cases, hypertension and shock among others.²¹ Considering that only 16 of 1,129 participants in the control group of the Pfizer trial tested positive for COVID-19²² – of note, a positive test is not necessarily illness – whereas in the treatment group 3 in 4 participants experienced fatigue and headaches, around half muscle pain, and 1 in 4 joint pain, the relative benefits of the COVID-19 products remain at best dubious.⁴

¹⁸ World Medical Association. (1964). *Declaration of Helsinki*. New England Journal of Medicine, 271(9), 473–474. https://doi.org/10.1056/nejm196408272710913

¹⁹ Lehto, E. (2021, October 7). *Finland joins Sweden and Denmark in limiting Moderna COVID-19 vaccine*. Reuters. Retrieved November 24, 2021, from https://www.reuters.com/world/europe/finland-pauses-use-moderna-covid-19-vaccine-young-men-2021-10-07/

²⁰ Høeg, T. B., Krug, A., Stevenson, J., & Mandrola, J. (2021). SARS-CoV-2 mRNA Vaccination-Associated Myocarditis in Children Ages 12–17: A Stratified National Database Analysis. medRxiv. Published. <u>https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.08.30.21262866</u>

²¹ Groves, H. (2021, August 6). *Myocarditis and pericarditis after mRNA COVID-19 vaccination in children: Interim guidance*. SickKids. Retrieved November 17, 2021, from

https://www.sickkids.ca/contentassets/50c1bd3c95e74dcf9fa7c9f6fd707bd7/interim-guidance_myocarditis-pericarditis-after-mrna-covid-19-vaccination-in -children.pdf

²² Frenck, R. W., Klein, N. P., Kitchin, N., Gurtman, A., Absalon, J., Lockhart, S., Perez, J. L., Walter, E. B., Senders, S., Bailey, R., Swanson, K. A., Ma, H., Xu, X., Koury, K., Kalina, W. V., Cooper, D., Jennings, T., Brandon, D. M., Thomas, S. J., . . . Gruber, W. C. (2021). *Safety, Immunogenicity, and Efficacy of the BNT162b2 Covid-19 Vaccine in Adolescents*. New England Journal of Medicine, 385(3), 239–250. <u>https://doi.org/10.1056/nejmoa2107456</u>



Additionally, phase III trials are the highest level of evidence and our best tool for ascertaining the risks and benefits of a treatment. Results from the phase III trial of the Pfizer/BioNTech BNT162b2 mRNA product through 6 months were recently reported by Thomas et al. in the New England Journal of Medicine.²³ The study, which compared the mRNA COVID-19 vaccine to placebo in healthy adults, showed an absolute risk reduction (ARR) in symptomatic and PCR-confirmed COVID-19 cases among fully vaccinated individuals of 3.7%, *but an absolute risk increase (ARI) of 17.9% in treatment-related adverse effects in that same group.* As well, the study reported an ARR in severe COVID-19 cases of 0.1% among the fully vaccinated, *but also an ARI in serious adverse events among vaccine recipients of 0.5%.* While deaths were relatively comparable across arms initially (15 vs 14 deaths, vaccine vs placebo, respectively), 5 additional deaths were reported in vaccine recipients after cross over, bringing the total death count after vaccination to 20. (Table 1). Of note, there were nearly twice as many deaths *due to cardiac events in the vaccine arm compared to the placebo arm (9 vs 5 deaths).* Results of the BNT162b2 mRNA COVID-19 phase III clinical trial clearly demonstrate at the highest level of evidence that the risks associated with the BNT162b2 mRNA COVID-19 vaccine outweigh the risks of COVID-19 in healthy adults, and do not support claims about the safety of these products, in this or any other population, and regardless of antibody levels.

Finally, vaccine safety reporting systems are revealing a record number of injuries. As of October 15, 2021, reported adverse events worldwide had surpassed 2,344,240 in the WHO reporting system Vigiaccess.²⁴ VAERS recorded 122,833 serious adverse events, 17,128 of which ended in death, post administration of COVID products. For context, the combined serious adverse events, including deaths upon administering all (around 70) vaccines, except for COVID products, that have been reported to VAERS since 1990 when the system was established, was 103,767 and 9,054, respectively.²⁵ *Put another way, about 50% of serious adverse events ever recorded in the over 30 years of the existence of VAERS were associated with three COVID products*

²³ Thomas, S. J., Moreira, E. D., Kitchin, N., Absalon, J., Gurtman, A., Lockhart, S., Perez, J. L., Pérez Marc, G., Polack, F. P., Zerbini, C., Bailey, R., Swanson, K. A., Xu, X., Roychoudhury, S., Koury, K., Bouguermouh, S., Kalina, W. V., Cooper, D., Frenck, R. W., . . . Jansen, K. U. (2021). *Safety and Efficacy of the BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine through 6 Months*. New England Journal of Medicine, 385(19), 1761–1773. https://doi.org/10.1056/neimoa2110345

²⁴ World Health Organization. *VigiAccess - WHO Collaborating Center for International Drug Monitoring*. Published October 10, 2021. http://vigiaccess.org/

²⁵ Search VAERS Database. MedAlerts. Retrieved October 26, 2021, from <u>https://medalerts.org/</u>



(AstraZeneca's product was not approved in the USA) *within less than one year.* Even these staggering numbers *underreport* the true adverse events post COVID products by a factor of at least 10²⁶ and likely as high as 41.²⁷

VAERS data from October 22, 2021, for 12- to 17-year-olds specifically revealed:

- 22,212 total adverse events,²⁸ including 1,348 rated as serious and 25 reported deaths (2 were suicides).
- 58 reports of anaphylaxis among 12- to 17-year-olds where the reaction was life-threatening, required treatment, or resulted in death.²⁹
- 539 reports of myocarditis and pericarditis (heart inflammation).³⁰
- 125 reports of blood clotting disorders.³¹

A recent death involved a 12-year-old girl (VAERS I.D. 1784945) who died from a respiratory tract hemorrhage 22 days after receiving her first Pfizer product dose. Another recent death is the case of a 16-year-old girl (VAERS I.D. 1694568) who died of pulmonary embolism 9 days after a Pfizer product dose

²⁶ Lazarus, R., MBBS, MPH, MMed, GDCompSci, & Klompas, M., MD, MPH. (2010, September). *Electronic Support for Public Health–Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System (ESP:VAERS) (R18 HS 017045)*. Harvard Pilgrim Health Care, Inc. https://digital.ahrq.gov/sites/default/files/docs/publication/r18hs017045-lazarus-final-report-2011.pdf

 ²⁷ Rose, J., Crawford, M., & Kirsch, S. (2021, November 1). *Estimating the number of COVID vaccine deaths in America*. Retrieved November 17, 2021, from http://www.skirsch.com/covid/Deaths.pdf

²⁸ National Vaccine Information Center. (2021, October 22). *Found 22,212 cases where Age is 12-or-more-and-under-18 and Location is U.S., Territories, or Unknown and Vaccine targets COVID-19 (COVID19)*. MedAlerts. Retrieved October 22, 2021, from

https://medalerts.org/vaersdb/findfield.php?TABLE=ON&GROUP1=AGE&EVENTS=ON&VAX=COVID19&VAXTYPES=COVID-19&STATE=NOTFR&WhichAge=range&LOWAGE=12&HIGHAGE=18

²⁹ National Vaccine Information Center. (2021, October 22). *Found 58 cases where Age is 12-or-more-and-under-18 and Location is U.S., Territories, or Unknown and Vaccine is COVID19 and Symptom is Anaphylactic reaction or Anaphylactic shock or Anaphylactoid reaction or Anaphylactoid shock or Anaphylaxis prophylaxis or Anaphylaxis treatment.* MedAlerts. Retrieved October 22, 2021, from

https://medalerts.org/vaersdb/findfield.php?TABLE=ON&GROUP1=AGE&EVENTS=ON&SYMPTOMS[]=Anaphylactic+reaction+%2810002198%29&SYMPTO MS[]=Anaphylactic+shock+%2810002199%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Anaphylactoid+reaction+%2810002216%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Anaphylactoid+shock+%2810003 119%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Anaphylaxis+prophylaxis+%2810049090%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Anaphylaxis+treatment+%281000222%29&VAX=COVID19&STATE=N OTFR&WhichAge=range&LOWAGE=12&HIGHAGE=18

³⁰ National Vaccine Information Center. (2021, October 22). Found 539 cases where Age is 12-or-more-and-under-18 and Location is U.S., Territories, or Unknown and Vaccine is COVID19 and Symptom is Myocarditis or Pericarditis. MedAlerts. Retrieved October 22, 2021, from https://medalerts.org/vaersdb/findfield.php?TABLE=ON&GROUP1=AGE&EVENTS=ON&SYMPTOMS[]=Myocarditis+%2810028606%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Peric arditis+%2810034484%29&VAX=COVID19&STATE=NOTFR&WhichAge=range&LOWAGE=12&HIGHAGE=18

³¹ National Vaccine Information Center. (2021, October 22). Found 27,164 cases where Symptom is Cerebral venous sinus thrombosis or Cerebral venous thrombosis or Coagulopathy or Deep vein thrombosis or Disseminated intravascular coagulation or Embolism or Idiopathic thrombocytopenic purpura or Immune thrombocytopenia or Immune thrombocytopenic purpura or Ischaemic stroke or Myocardial infarction or Petechiae or Pulmonary embolism or Purpura or Thrombocytopenia. MedAlerts. Retrieved October 22, 2021, from

https://medalerts.org/vaersdb/findfield.php?TABLE=ON&GROUP1=AGE&EVENTS=ON&SYMPTOMS[]=Cerebral+venous+sinus+thrombosis+%2810083037% 29&SYMPTOMS[]=Cerebral+venous+thrombosis+%2810008138%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Coagulopathy+%281009802%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Deep+vein+thrombos is+%2810051055%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Disseminated+intravascular+coagulation+%2810013442%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Embolism+%2810061169%29&SYMPTO MS[]=ldiopathic+thrombocytopenic+purpura+%2810021245%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Immune+thrombocytopenia+%2810083842%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Immune+ thrombocytopenic+purpura+%2810074667%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Ischaemic+stroke+%2810061256%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Mvocardial+infarction+%2810028596 %29&SYMPTOMS[]=Petechiae+%2810034754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Pulmonary+embolism+%2810037377%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Purpura+%2810037549%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Purpura+%2810037549%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Purpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTOMS[]=Durpura+%281003754%29&SYMPTO



(whether it was the first or second is unknown). Yet another recent death was that of a 15-year-old boy who died six days after receiving his first dose of Pfizer product. The VAERS report (I.D. 1764974) states that the previously healthy teen 'was in his usual state of good health. Five days after the vaccine, he complained of shoulder pain. He was playing with 2 friends at a community pond, swinging from a rope swing, flipping in the air, and landing in the water feet first. He surfaced, laughed, told his friends "Wow, that hurt!", then swam toward shore, underwater as was his usual routine. The friends became worried when he did not re-emerge. His body was retrieved by local authorities more than an hour later.' The autopsy revealed 'small foci of myocardial inflammation', an adverse effect of these COVID products commonly found among children and youth, particularly young men.

Of note, *none of these reports include long-term adverse events*, critical to assessing the safety of any medical product. If the history of drug development – such as that of thalidomide, dengue vaccine, and swine flu vaccine - teaches us anything, it is that the harm caused by implementing "remedies" that have not been properly tested can be much greater than the harm caused by the "disease" that these remedies are designed to treat.^{32, 33, 34}

In conclusion, we thank you for taking the time to read our analysis, expect it will contribute to your efforts to keep young Ontarians safe, and would appreciate the opportunity to engage and collaborate with you and members of your team towards that goal.

Respectfully,

Claudia Chaufan, MD PhD³⁵

³² Vargesson, N. (2015). *Thalidomide-induced teratogenesis: History and mechanisms*. Birth Defects Research Part C: Embryo Today: Reviews, 105(2), 140–156. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/bdrc.21096</u>

³³ Su, S., Du, L., & Jiang, S. (2020). *Learning from the past: development of safe and effective COVID-19 vaccines*. Nature Reviews Microbiology, 19(3), 211–219. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41579-020-00462-y</u>

³⁴ Sencer, D. J., & Millar, J. D. (2006). *Reflections on the 1976 Swine Flu Vaccination Program*. Emerging Infectious Diseases, 12(1), 23–28. https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1201.051007

³⁵ Associate Professor, Health Policy, York University



Signatories

Steven Pelech, PhD³⁶

Deanna McLeod, HBSc³⁷

Olga Collins, BSc³⁸

Maximilian Forte, PhD³⁹

Daphene Francis PhD, RN⁴⁰

Jeffrey Graham, PhD⁴¹

Anton de Ruiter, PhD⁴²

Denis Rancourt, PhD⁴³

Claus Rinner, PhD44

Julie Ponesse, PhD⁴⁵

Jan Vrbik, PhD⁴⁶

Keren Epstein-Gilboa, PhD47

Angela Durante, PhD⁴⁸

³⁶ Professor, Medicine, University of British Columbia

³⁷ Principal & Lead Strategist, Evidence-Based Medicine, Kaleidoscope Strategic Inc; Steering Committee and Scientific Advisory Committee Member, Canadian Covid Care Alliance

³⁸ Research Technician, Molecular Biology, United Healthcare Workers of Ontario

³⁹ Professor, Sociology and Anthropology, Concordia University

⁴⁰ Professor, Nursing Leadership, Equity Diversity & Inclusion, Georgian College

⁴¹ Associate Professor, Psychology, University of Toronto

⁴² Professor, Aerospace Engineering, Ryerson University

⁴³ Researcher, Ontario Civil Liberties Association

⁴⁴ Professor, Geographic Information Science, Ryerson University

⁴⁵ Ethics and Ancient Philosophy, Independent Scholar

⁴⁶ Professor, Mathematics, Brock University

⁴⁷ Psychology, Independent Scholar

⁴⁸ Canadian History, Independent Scholar

HANDS OFF OUR CHILDREN CCCA – EXTERNAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMITTEE

www.canadiancovidcarealliance.org



Heather Springer, PhD⁴⁹

Anthony J. Hall, PhD⁵⁰

Jens Zimmerman, PhD⁵¹

Laurent Leduc, PhD⁵²

Kevin Cheung, PhD⁵³

Valentina Capurri, PhD⁵⁴

Michael C. Owen, PhD⁵⁵

Laurie Manwell, PhD⁵⁶

⁴⁹ Assistant Professor, Exercise & Environmental Physiology, Ontario Tech University

⁵⁰ Professor Emeritus, Globalization Studies and Liberal Education, University of Lethbridge

⁵¹ Professor, Humanities (Ethics), Regent College

⁵² Professor Emeritus, Interdisciplinary Science and Theology, University of Toronto

⁵³ Operations Research, Independent Scholar

⁵⁴ Lecturer, Immigration & Disability Studies, Ryerson University

⁵⁵ Structural Biochemistry and Biophysics, Independent Scholar

⁵⁶ Psychology & Toxicology, Independent Scholar



Table 1

Table 1. Differences in efficacy and safety events reported in the 6-month update of the BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine

Event	BNT162b2 (n)	Placebo (n)	Absolute Difference (p-value)	Absolute Risk Change* (%)	Relative Risk Change* (%)
Total Randomized Adults and Adolescents (n)	23,219	23,210			
Fully Vaccinated Cases Adults and Adolescents ^s COVID-like symptoms + PCR	77	850	-773 (p<.00001)	-3.7	-90.9
Any Treatment-Related Adverse Event Adults [#]	5,241	1,311	+3,930 (p<.00001)	+17.9	+298.3
Any Severe Event Adults [/]	278	187	+91 (p=.000022)	+0.4	+48.7
Full Vaccinated Severe Cases Adults ^{&} COVID-like symptoms + PCR	1	23	-22 (p<.00001)	-0.1	-95.6
Severe Adverse Events Adults Prevents daily routine activity or requires intervention or worse	262	150	+112 (p<.00001)	+0.5	+71.4
Deaths during placebo-controlled period [additional deaths during open- label period in vaccine recipients or those that only received <u>placebo</u> 1 [%]	15 [+5]	14 [NR]	+1 [+5] (p=.853117)	+0.005 [+0.022]	+7.1 [+35.7]
Deaths due to cardiac events^	7	4	+3		

* Significance figures (p-values) estimated using a chi-square calculator available at

https://www.socscistatistics.com/tests/chisquare. P-values are without the Yates correction. This procedure was applied following the framework used by Classen (2021) in their analysis of "All Cause Severe Morbidity" based on data from the initial reports of the vaccine Phase III trials.²



* Absolute and relative risk change calculations were performed using the common statistical definition, ie. number of events relative to total number of eligible patients for each event analysis reported;³ vaccine efficacy estimates reported at source used total surveillance time as denominator, however, this value is not available for all the events analyzed

^{\$} ≥7 Days after dose 2 among participants without evidence of previous infection

[#] Assessed by the investigator as related to investigational product

⁷ In calculations combining efficacy and safety events, the number of patients randomized that received any dose of vaccine or placebo was used as the study population in the statistical calculations, following the framework used by Classen (2021) in their analysis of "All Cause Severe Morbidity".2 Differences in the total (event-incident) population (ITT vs efficacy vs safety) used as denominator are relatively small and are expected to have minimal impact on the relative differences between arms.

[&] ≥7 Days after dose 2

[%] During the open-label period, 3 participants in the BNT162b2 group and 2 in the original placebo group who received BNT162b2 after unblinding died

[^] Those with reported cause of death due to: cardiac arrest, cardiac failure congestive, cardiorespiratory arrest, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, hypertensive heart disease, or myocardial infarction.